

*Village of Barrington
Architectural Review Commission
Minutes Summary*

Date: March 12, 2015

Time: 7:00 p.m.

Location: Village Board Room
200 South Hough Street
Barrington, Illinois

In Attendance: Karen Plummer, Commissioner
Chris Geissler, Commissioner
April Goshe, Commissioner
Joe Coath, Vice-Chairperson
Marty O'Donnell, Chairperson

Staff Members: Jennifer Tennant
Jean Emerick

Call to Order

Chairperson O'Donnell called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

Roll call noted the following: Karen Plummer, present; Scott Kozak, absent; Chris Geissler, present; April Goshe, present; Patrick Lytle, absent; Vice-Chairperson Joe Coath, present; Chairperson Marty O'Donnell, present.

There being a quorum, the meeting proceeded.

Chairperson's Remarks

Chairperson O'Donnell announced the order of proceedings.

#####

Old Business

ARC 05-28: 303 S. Hough Street – Final Details

Owner: Mr. Joshua Barney
303 S. Hough Street
Barrington, Illinois 60010

On January 12, 2006, the ARC approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for ARC 05-28 – 303 S. Hough Street. The Petitioner was granted approval to demolish the existing detached garage (contributing) and reconstruct a new detached garage (noncontributing). The garage was never reconstructed.

On October 28, 2010, the ARC issued a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the demolition of the existing detached garage without reconstruction of a new garage. The ARC conditioned approval upon the fact that any changes to the approved plans for a new garage would be subject to ARC review and approval.

At this time, the Petitioner is proposing to construct a new garage on the subject property. The proposal is similar to the garage originally approved in 2006, but not identical, therefore, ARC review and approval is required.

The approved garage had several features designed to mimic the original historic garage that was demolished such as a faux door facing Lake Street, new garage doors consistent with the style of the original garage door, horizontal wood siding on the main portion of the walls, vertical wood siding on the gable ends and square windows. Staff is concerned that the new proposed garage has eliminated many of the features that were designed to mimic the original historic structure.

Mr. Josh Barney, 303 S. Hough Street, the petitioner, said that his property used to be owned by four people. He bought out the other owners. He is living there now with his three kids and he would like to have a garage. At the time the garage was designed, the property was going to be quasi-commercial with residential on the second floor. The garage was supposed to face the house and there would be a lot of concrete for parking. Now it is a house and he would rather have more grass and less concrete. He would like to change the direction of the garage to face Lake Street.

Ms. Tennant said the Commission has pictures of the original garage, the approved plans from 2005, and the new packet.

Mr. Barney said he would like a three-car garage and to build it as inexpensively as possible.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said he has trouble with reviewing this petition as a detail. The project has changed and is conceptually different.

Mr. Barney believes it is same except for the orientation.

Chairperson O'Donnell said it is not similar other than it is a three-car garage. He thinks it is a new project because of all the differences. He will need more detail to approve it. His opinion is that the petitioner should side it with wood, as Hardie board would be more expensive.

Commissioner Goshe agreed that wood is less expensive but higher maintenance.

Commissioner Geissler asked if this is a new project or a final detail.

Ms. Tennant said the Zoning Official made a determination that the alterations were minor enough to be considered a final detail. ARC cases do not expire. As determined by the Village attorney, it does not need a new public hearing.

Commissioner Plummer said it is not the project that came to the Commission before.

Ms. Tennant said some of the details that were part of the original design were not carried through to this one.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said the pitch is much steeper now. The drawings of the cornice and the edge of the roof are just a simplified builder version.

Commissioner Plummer thinks there should be a discussion about the orientation of the garage.

Vice-Chairperson Coath thinks the entrance should be facing the west.

Ms. Tennant said the original plan will not meet zoning now because of impervious surface. The new plan is compliant with the Village's ordinances.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked if the Commission could request that the petitioner go ahead with Karl's plans.

Ms. Tennant said they could.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said they should replace the replicated doors with two double-hung windows. He would like to see an elevation.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked the petitioner to come back to the next meeting with details.

Ms. Tennant said the next meeting is April 9th.

There was a consensus of the Commission with the following recommendations:

1. The ARC was not in favor of the newly proposed garage design. After discussion with Staff and the Petitioner, The ARC determined that the originally approved garage design (designed by Heitman Architects and approved in 2006) is the more appropriate option for this property.
2. The ARC was not in favor of the proposed reorientation of the garage to face Lake Street (north). After discussion with Staff and the Petitioner, the ARC determined that the original orientation facing the interior of the lot (west) is the more appropriate option for this property.
3. The ARC approved modifications to the north elevation including eliminating the faux overhead garage door and the addition of two double hung windows.
4. The ARC strongly recommends the use of wood siding rather than cementitious siding. If cementitious siding is selected, the siding must have a 5/8" butt dimension.
5. The following final details must be brought back to the ARC for consideration:
 - (a) Provide a revised site plan showing the final garage location.
 - (b) Provide a section detail including the eave and cornice configuration.
 - (c) Provide a revised north elevation eliminating the faux overhead garage door and adding two double hung windows.
 - (d) Provide final windows and overhead garage door selections. All garage doors must be wood.

#####

ARC 14-01: 526 S. Grove Avenue – Final Details

Owner: Rob and Andrea Connors
526 S. Grove Avenue
Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: S.A. Petersen Architects, Sarah Petersen

On May 8, 2014, the ARC approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for 526 S. Grove Avenue for a rear addition and new rear porch. On November 14, 2014, The ARC approved final details to remove the originally proposed porch skirting on the rear porch. At this time, the Petitioner is requesting approval to screen in the rear porch.

Ms. Andrea Connor, 526 S. Grove, said the back porch was approved by ARC last year. In November, the petitioner requested to put screens on the back porch. She provided the porch drawings and a sketch of the screen door that they will be adding.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked if the screen will be behind the rail.

Ms. Conner said it is proposed to put the screens on the outside of the porch, but they have not decided.

Vice-Chairperson Coath likes the screen on the inside better.

Ms. Tennant said that the design guidelines recommend screens on the inside.

Commissioner Goshe said the door should be in alignment with the railing frame.

The Commission agreed with the following recommendations:

1. The porch door should be aligned with the railing frame.
2. The screen must be located inside the porch.

#####

ARC 15-03: 412 S. Cook Street – Public Hearing

Owner: Lena and Jin Chon
412 S. Cook Street
Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: HBB Architectural (Julie Dunne)
533 North Avenue
Barrington, IL 60010

The applicant is seeking approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to a property in the H-Historic Preservation Overlay District. The petitioner is proposing to restore and expand the existing front porch. The Petitioner is also proposing to add a window on the second story elevation and replace the existing siding and gutters. The property is zoned R-6 Single-Family and is in the H-Historic Preservation Overlay District. The current use of the property is residential and the parcel is approximately 8,746 sq. ft.

Ms. Julie Dunne, architect for the Chons, said the contractor was out and took some more measurements of the window well. They have enough space to shift the wrap around porch back a little farther. She said there was a question about the placement of the post on the end that was blocking the view of the window. The window on the second floor is in the correct location in the paperwork now; it was an error on her part.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked if the Village could make an exception for historical homes on the height of the railing.

Ms. Tennant said that the Village cannot vary from the building code. They have allowed things to remain the same, the petitioner cannot put in new that does not meet building code.

Chairperson O'Donnell likes the columns and would like them to stay.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said they should aim for a 4-inch exposure for the siding, which is typical.

Chairperson O'Donnell said they should use 4-inch or match the existing. They will need to find out what is underneath.

The petitioner said she would like 5-inch.

The Commission said 4-inch is recommended, 5-inch would not be consistent with what would have traditionally been used when the house was built. They should match existing.

Ms. Dunne said that they intend to keep the windows the way they are.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said in the drawing, the lintel beam is out past the top edge of the capital block.

Ms. Dunne said their intention is to match existing.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said they should do a more typical board skirt. They will need the ventilation.

Ms. Dunne will get a photograph of the skirting they propose as a final detail.

Ms. Tennant mentioned that the pitches on the roof are different on the two sides of the wrap around.

Ms. Dunne said it just does not work on one side of the house. The sides will not be seen together.

Ms. Tennant asked if they will be using half round gutters on the porch.

Ms. Dunne said they will keep the existing gutters which are k-style.

The consensus of the Commission is a recommendation to replace with half round gutters.

A motion was made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Geissler to approve ARC 15-03, a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to restore and expand the existing front porch and replace the existing siding with the following conditions:

1. The existing porch columns shall be retained. All new porch columns shall match the existing porch columns.
2. Upon removal of the existing vinyl siding layers, the Petitioner shall contact Staff to arrange an inspection to determine the condition of the original wood siding. Upon inspection of the siding, the ARC shall determine if all of the siding must remain, a portion of the siding must remain, or if all the siding has deteriorated beyond repair and can be removed and replaced. If the siding is replaced, the exposure of the replacement siding shall match the exposure of the original siding.
3. If replacement siding is deemed necessary, the replacement siding shall be wood (smooth clear cedar) siding. The siding on the rear addition may be wood or cementitious siding with a 5/8" butt dimension.
4. All architectural components of the porch extension shall match the conditions on the existing portion of the porch. The lentil center should be centered on the column.
5. The gutter on the north and south elevations shall return to the house.
6. The new corner boards should match the dimensions of the original corner boards.

Roll Call Vote: Commission Plummer, yes; Commissioner Kozak, absent; Commissioner Geissler, yes; Commissioner Goshe, yes; Commissioner Lytle, absent; Vice-Chairperson Coath, yes; Chairperson O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 5 - 0. The motion carried.

#####

ARC 15-05: 141 W. Lincoln Avenue – Preliminary Review

Owner: Michael Malham
141 W. Lincoln Avenue
Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: Matthew Kerouac Architects
314 W. Hawthorne Court
Lake Bluff, IL 60044

The applicant is seeking approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to a property in the H-Historic Preservation Overlay District. The petitioner is proposing to construct a partial two-

story addition on the rear of the existing structure. The property is zoned R-6 Single-Family and is in the H-Historic Preservation Overlay District.

Mr. Michael Malham, 141 W. Lincoln, said there is a shed roof in the back that he wants to eliminate. They want a little more space. He said the roof line is challenging.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said he wished there were better ways to deal with it. He does not like the piggybacked gables. He asked about the foundation.

Mr. Malham said they will use cinder block because that is what is there.

The Commission recommended the following:

1. Provide a section detail for the proposed addition detailing the connection to the existing structure and intersection with the existing shed roof.
2. Carefully consider the foundation detail on the southeast side of the addition.

#####

Approval of Minutes

February 12, 2015

Commissioner Plummer made a motion to approve the February 12, 2015 meeting minutes, Commissioner Geissler seconded the motion. A voice vote noted all ayes, and Chairperson O'Donnell declared the motion approved.

Planners Report

Beth Raseman would like a recommendation from the ARC for the National Historic Register Plaque. Ms. Tennant shared a couple options with the Commission. The Commission agreed that they liked the second option best. Ms. Raseman would like the Commission to consider some educational programs (possibly relating to the Historic District) involving the ARC for when the White House opens in July.

Adjournment

There being no additional business to come before the Board, a motion was duly made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Geissler to adjourn the meeting at 8:50 p.m. A voice vote noted all ayes, and Chairperson O'Donnell declared the motion approved.

Respectfully submitted,

Jean Emerick
Executive Assistant


Marty O'Donnell, Chairperson
Architectural Review Commission

Approval Date: