

*Village of Barrington
Architectural Review Commission
Minutes Summary*

Date: April 14, 2016

Time: 7:00 p.m.

Location: Village Board Room
200 South Hough Street
Barrington, Illinois

In Attendance: Karen Plummer, Commissioner
Patrick Lytle, Commissioner
Joe Coath, Vice-Chairperson
Marty O'Donnell, Chairperson

Staff Members: Jennifer Tennant

Call to Order

Chairperson O'Donnell called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

Roll call noted the following: Karen Plummer, present; Scott Kozak, absent; Chris Geissler, absent; April Goshe, absent; Patrick Lytle, present; Vice-Chairperson Joe Coath, present; Chairperson Marty O'Donnell, present.

There being a quorum, the meeting proceeded.

Chairperson's Remarks

Chairperson O'Donnell announced the order of proceedings.

#####

Old Business

ARC 15-09: 238 Coolidge Avenue – Final Details

Owner/Applicant: James Carlstrom
121 Joan Drive
Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: Steve Klumpp
Ar-K-Teks

300 N. 11th Street
Wheeling, IL 60090

The applicant is seeking final details approval for the Certificate of Appropriateness issued for 238 Coolidge Avenue.

Steve Klumpp, project architect, presented the project to the Commission. Mr. Klumpp stated that they have addressed the comments from the last meeting by adding a porch skirt detail, clarifying the dimension of the porch column and clarifying the 2x2 frieze board. They do not find evidence of a 1x6 frieze board and feel it would be redundant to install both. Lastly, Jim Carlstrom wanted to add two dormers to back of the garage in lieu of installing a window on the rear elevation. He also wants to add a covered area over the rear entry door.

Commissioner Lytle said that he does not have an issue with the dormers on the garage but thinks that they should match the dormers on the front of the garage. The other Commissioners agreed that the dormers on the rear of the garage should match the size and style of the dormers on the front.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said he is concerned about the covered area over the rear entry door. He does not want to see any flying roofs.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked if a bracket could be added to fix the issue. Mr. Klumpp stated that hopefully Jim Carlstrom is OK with adding the brackets. The other Commissioners agreed that the addition of one bracket between the door and the window is necessary.

Commissioner Lytle asked if the Commission was OK with the frieze board. At the last meeting, the ARC gave you direction to investigate further which was not done.

Commissioner Coath said a typical cornice had a frieze board. Even if a 1x8 frieze board is not present, one is required because it would have been there on a typical cornice.

Mr. Klumpp said nothing indicates that there is a frieze board there now. They are satisfied without it.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said it would have been a three-part cornice.

Ms. Tennant clarified that a 1x8 frieze board is required or if an original frieze board is present it must be retained and restored. A 2-1/4" x 7/8" bed mold is also required.

Vice-Chairperson Coath asked about the dimensions of the window detail. The flat casing detail has the option to be 3-1/2 inch but there is also an option for a 4-1/2 inch casing which would be more appropriate. There is also a brick mold detail marked on the last page of the window details which appears to be incorrect because there is no brick on the building.

Vice-Chairperson Coath asked for clarification on the window header detail on the drawings. He said we need clarification for the head casing. The Commissioners agreed that an enlarged window detail with dimensions drawn at 1-1/2" scale with a proper profile must be provided as a final detail.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that he is not satisfied with the porch column detail. He would like to see a better detail of the base and capital. The other Commissioners agreed that a revised detail is necessary.

Commission Lytle said the plans say the gutters will match existing but the existing are K-style. Mr. Klumpp said they are doing half-round gutters.

A motion was made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Lytle to approve final details for ARC 15-09.

Roll Call Vote: Commission Plummer, yes; Commissioner Kozak, absent; Commissioner Geissler, absent; Commissioner Lytle, yes; Commissioner Goshe, absent; Vice-Chairperson Coath, yes; Chairperson O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 4-0. The motion carried.

#####

Old Business

ARC 16-01: 203 W. Northwest Highway (Pennino Family Dentistry) Public Hearing

Owner: Narwhal Properties LLC
1196 Williamsburg Lane
Crystal Lake, IL 60014

Architect: Silva Architects
168 E. Highland Avenue
Elgin, IL 60120

The Petitioner is seeking approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition to an existing detached garage. The exiting detached garage is a contributing structure in the H-Historic Preservation Overlay District.

Ms. Tennant stated that she has a clarification, she received an email from the architect and the require crown molding will be added to both the front and sides of the roof structures.

Vice-Chairperson said the plans are unclear because the plans call out a 1x3 cedar trim.

Ms. Tennant said it is called out as a 1x3 ogee cedar trim so it has a shape to it.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said it needs to be 3-5/8" crown molding, not a trim board. The other Commissioners agreed.

The Commissioners agrees that the light fixtures were acceptable.

A motion was made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Lytle to approve final details for ARC 16-01.

Roll Call Vote: Commission Plummer, yes; Commissioner Kozak, absent; Commissioner Geissler, absent; Commissioner Lytle, yes; Commissioner Goshe, yes; Vice-Chairperson Coath, yes; Chairperson O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 4-0. The motion carried.

#####

New Business

ARC 16-02: 322 N. Hough Street

Owner/Applicant: Owner – Village of Barrington
Applicant – Monroe Residential Partners

Architect: HKM
43 S. Vail Avenue
Arlington Heights, IL 60005

Drew Friestedt is one of the developers from Monroe Residential Partners. Mr. Friestedt presented several slides showing completed projects in the City of Chicago. Mr. Friestedt explained that their target product is 30-80 residential units with amenities such as a clubhouse, fitness center and/or a rooftop terrace. Their experience is vast and they will deliver an exceptional product to the Village.

The architect for the project, Mark Hopkins from HKM Architects, presented slides on the concept for the project. Some of the context for the proposed project has been influenced by buildings in Barrington such as the McGonigals building, the Ice House Mall building and the Cycle Werks building. The project is also influenced by old mercantile buildings which have been repurposed. They are trying to create a building with a story.

Mr. Hopkins explained that they are proposing an L-shaped building with underground parking and the main entrance on Liberty Street. The first floor is a combination of the lobby, mailroom bike storage, etc. as well as residential units. There is landscaping throughout to provide necessary transitions and screening. There is also a 10' easement on the south side of the property. They are proposing a 6' fence to screen the residents from the easement and Volo access driveway.

The building is four stories but three stories on Hough Street.

Mr. Hopkins said they are proposing a three story brick industrial building with traditional details that would have been found on the building such as pilaster treatment, cornice detail and infilled windows. The three story component wraps the building and then picks up the

lightweight materials found on the rear of the building. On the top of the building, we are proposing a community room, fitness room and rooftop deck. There will also be a penthouse unit with a private rooftop terrace. Mr. Hopkins goes on to explain the material choices which are a mix of brick and lighter weight corrugated metal sidings in various dimensions.

One of the comments we received last time was what will be done to screen the balconies. On Hough Street we have gone to a more solid perforated metal panel. This will have a great degree of obscurity along Hough Street. The balconies on the sides of the building will be a more traditional railing system

Mr. Hopkins presented material samples for the modular brick and face brick. They are proposing. Cast stone trim to match buff limestone. Two colors of corrugated metal panel system with three different patterns. We are proposing a vinyl charcoal window and charcoal store front windows for the large expanses of windows. We are also proposing a blade sign. The same of the project is "322 North Works" as if it were a factory building.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that he is concerned about the proposed vinyl windows. He asked why they are proposing vinyl, is it cost?

Mr. Hopkins replied that yes, it is cost. He said he doesn't think anyone will know it is vinyl from the street. There is a coating on the windows and a guarantee against fading.

Ms. Tennant said that it will be a variation from the Zoning Ordinance to use vinyl windows on the front and corner sides of the building. The ARC must make a recommendation to the Plan Commission on the use of vinyl windows. Staff is recommending aluminum clad windows.

Commissioner Lytle asked why the entrance is on the side of the building, not on the front of the building on Hough Street. He thinks it would alleviate some of the balcony issues on Hough Street.

Mr. Hopkins said from a use standpoint the entrance wants to be on the back of the building near the surface parking. Locating the entrance on Liberty Street is a compromise location.

Commissioner Lytle said he feel that an original building on this site would have had its entrance on Hough Street.

Mr. Friestedt said he feels the main entrance on Liberty Street is more inviting due to the busy traffic on Hough Street.

Mr. Hopkins said that Liberty Street will become more important in the future.

Ms. Tennant stated that an original building may have had an entrance on Liberty because of the industrial nature of Liberty Street verses Hough Street.

Chairperson O'Donnell said we are setting a precedent for the future development. This development will guide future development in this area.

Commissioner Plummer said we are setting up Liberty Street to become more important in the future.

Commissioner Lytle asked about the split of the brick as you turn the corner on the south side of the building. He is wondering if three dimensionally if the front will appear too small.

Mr. Friestedt asked to come back to the vinyl window issue. He said they would upgrade if they could but would want the option to use vinyl. They do not want to be required to upgrade the windows.

Chairperson O'Donnell stated that he is very supportive of the project but is still concerned about the use of vinyl windows.

Commissioner Lytle stated his concern on vinyl windows is the longevity of the product but understands that technology has changed. However, we need to be a little more open to some of these materials and explore this further.

Ms. Tennant clarified that if a vinyl window is approved here, it will not be approved for use in the historic district.

Commissioner Lytle asked if the jambs will be colored as well. This is a concern.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that the manufacture may want to come out and make a presentation to the ARC on the vinyl window.

Commissioner Lytle asked about screening for rooftop units. Mr. Hopkins said they are showing the necessary screening on the elevations. The residential condenser will be below the parapet. They understand that 100% screening is required.

Ms. Tennant stated that 100% screening is required by the Zoning Ordinance.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked what staff is asking of the ARC tonight, to approve the vinyl windows?

Ms. Tennant said that she is asking them to make a recommendation to the Plan Commission because the Plan Commission will have to grant a variation for use of vinyl windows. However, the Plan Commission is still a ways off so more information could be brought back to the ARC before the case goes to Plan Commission. However before it goes to Plan Commission there must be a recommendation from the ARC.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said he agrees that additional research on the window is necessary. He would want to see an actual installation of the product. It's a big deal because the success of the project is going to rely on the materials.

Ms. Tennant said that the ARC needs to see more information on the windows before the final meeting.

Commissioner Plummer asked the other Commissioners about the overall design and massing of the building.

Vice-chairperson Coath said he is good with the massing and the fourth story is sufficiently far back. A lot is going to depend on the richness of the materials. He would like to see some embellishment on the building. The Commonwealth Edison is a masonry structure with good detailing. He likes the overall narrative of the building. The building does lack some street presence on Hough Street without an entrance feature. He likes the more solid balconies on Hough Street. Take care with the cornice detail. He is not a fan of cast stone because it does not weather the same as limestone. It comes off as synthetic over time.

Chairperson O'Donnell said he likes the entrance on Liberty Street because it speaks to the future of the area. He likes the balconies and the way they are hung on the building.

Commissioner Plummer said she is concerned about the variety of materials on the building. She would like to see the materials.

Chairperson O'Donnell said he is supportive of the massing and thinks the project will be successful.

#####

New Business

ARC 16-03: 239 W. Russell Street – Preliminary Review

Owner/Applicant: Matthew and Crystal DiDomenico
 239 W. Russell Street
 Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: Meyers-Wichman (Chris Wichman)

Chris Wichman, architect for the project, presented on behalf of the property owners.

Mr. Wichman explained that they are trying to maintain the existing house, they do not want to impact the style and look of the house. They are proposing a two story side and rear addition. One condition

brought up in the Staff Report is the bay window. They would like to keep the bay. Mr. Wichman said there is no part of the addition that is trying to go beyond the existing house.

Ms. Tennant said that the issue with the bay is that it is floating.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that the bay cannot float.

Vice-chairperson Coath said they are proposing brackets. You have the bay going down to the floor level as opposed to the sill level. Brackets would work with a sill level bay. Commissioner Lytle said he likes the bay as drawn. The other Commissioners agree that the bay with brackets is acceptable.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that plans show the off-set as one foot in one spot and three feet in another spot. Three feet would be the absolute minimum but would prefer more. Chairperson O'Donnell also asked what the foundation treatment is.

Mr. Wichman explained that they would like to go with the block but the existing block is very difficult to match. They are proposing brick instead. The Commission agrees that brick is acceptable.

Vice-chairperson Coath said he is OK with the three foot setback because the horizontal dimension is less than the primary structure so it is not competing.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that makes sense, if the addition is not overwhelming the original structure.

Commissioner Lytle said he is concerned about the large window on the second story rear elevation.

Mr. Wichman said he chose a fixed window above the bed.

Commissioner Plummer said she likes the window because it references a barn style which is compatible with the house.

Vice-chairperson Coath said they should carefully consider the divided lights, more consistency is necessary.

Mr. Wichman said these are casement windows.

Commissioner Lytle said they make casements that look like a double hung. Vice-chairperson Coath said they are very convincing.

Ms. Tennant asked for comments on the garage.

Mr. Wichman said the garage will be located.

Chairperson O'Donnell said he liked the design of the garage.

Mr. Wichman asked if the dormer will be acceptable. The Commissioner agreed that the dormer is acceptable.

Vice-Chairperson Coath recommends a garage door with windows on top. The door on the existing garage is not original, it does not have to be kept.

Chairperson O'Donnell said consider a window on the rear elevation of the garage.

#####

New Business

ARC 16-04: 621 S. Grove Avenue – Public Hearing

Owner/Applicant: Erin and Sherman Shechtman
621 S. Grove Avenue
Barrington, IL 60010

Architect: Joseph Meyer/Chris Wichman
Structural & Professional Engineer
135 Park Ave
Barrington, IL 60010

Chris Wichman, architect for the project, presented on behalf of the property owner.

Mr. Wichman explained that we just want to follow the exact same details as the existing house. They are proposing a prefabricated metal frame screen system. The door will be wood.

Chairperson O'Donnell said he has no concerns.

Vice-Chairperson Coath asked why the dimension cannot be maintained in the corner. The corner is pretty big.

Commissioner Lytle said you need to have room to attached the screens so the corners will be a little bit larger.

Commissioner Lytle asked what is going to happen at the front where the screen porch meets the existing house.

Mr. Wichman said basically you will be looking at a triangle on the side. Or he can return the gutter and fascia into the house. There are k-style gutters on the house now. They are planning to match.

Ms. Tennant said the ARC approved the k-style gutters for this house in 2006.

Chairperson O'Donnell said they can match the gutters.

A motion was made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Vice-chairperson Coath to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for ARC 16-04.

Roll Call Vote: Commission Plummer, yes; Commissioner Kozak, absent; Commissioner Geissler, absent; Commissioner Lytle, yes; Commissioner Goshe, yes; Vice-Chairperson Coath, yes; Chairperson O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 4-0. The motion carried.

#####

New Business

ARC 16-04: Materials Review – Crestline Aluminum Clad & Wood Windows

Ms. Tennant said that Staff is looking for feedback on the Crestline windows. A resident has asked to use these windows but Staff is bringing the windows forward for consideration for the whole district.

The owners of 247 Coolidge Avenue, Mr. and Mrs. Penkava, were present and brought the sashes for the Crestline aluminum clad windows.

Chairperson O'Donnell said they are more interested in the sections than the sashes. The approved windows are Marvin Ultimate, Kolbe Kolbe, Hurd and Jeld Wen.

Ms. Tennant clarified that the only clad window approved is the Marvin Ultimate. All the other approved windows are all wood.

Chairperson O'Donnell said that he would go to Menards and view the windows in person.

Vice-chairperson Coath also agree to view the windows in person.

Ms. Tennant said Staff has a hard time explaining to our residents what the ARC is looking for in a window.

Chairperson O'Donnell and Vice-chairperson Coath will review the windows at Menards and report back to the ARC.

#####

Approval of Minutes

February 25, 2016

The February 25, 2016 minutes were unable to be approved because the appropriate commission members were not in attendance.

March 10, 2016

The March 10, 2016 minutes were unable to be approved because the appropriate commission members were not in attendance.

Planners Report

No Planners Report.

Adjournment

There being no additional business to come before the Board, a motion was duly made by Commissioner Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Lytle to adjourn the meeting at 9:40 p.m. A voice vote noted all ayes, and Chairperson O'Donnell declared the motion approved.

Respectfully submitted,

Jennifer Tennant
Assistant Director of Development Services


Marty O'Donnell, Chairperson
Architectural Review Commission

Approval Date:

May 3, 2016