Village of Barrington
Architectural Review Commission Special Meeting Minutes Summary

Date: March 11, 2021

Time: 6:30 p.m.

Location: **Virtual** through ZOOM

In Attendance: Marty O'Donnell, Chairperson
Joe Coath, Vice-Chairperson
Karen Plummer, Commissioner
Kevin Connolly, Commissioner
Tim Renaud, Commissioner

Staff: Jennifer Tennant, Assistant Director of Development Services
Andrew Binder, Planning & Zoning Coordinator

Call to Order
Chairperson O'Donnell called the **virtual** special meeting through ZOOM to order at 6:30 p.m.

Roll call noted the following: Leslie Haynes-Eiring, absent; Tim Renaud, present; Kevin Connolly, present; Karen Plummer, present; Vice-Chairperson Joe Coath, present; Chairperson Marty O'Donnell, present.

There being a quorum, the meeting proceeded.

Old Business

ARC 20-02: 237 W. Station Street – Final Review

PROPERTY OWNER: David Gordon, 237 W. Station Street, Barrington, IL 60010
APPLICANT: David Gordon, 237 W. Station Street, Barrington, IL 60010
ARCHITECT: Mark Swanson

The Petitioner is requesting the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a one-story addition to the west side of the existing contributing primary structure. The property is zoned R-6 Single Family Residential District/Historic Overlay District.

Mrs. Tennant presented an overview of the project and noted that the project got smaller from the original submittal.

Chairperson O'Donnell stated that the setback is the only issue and in order to have the rear setback meet zoning, the addition has to be reduced in size.

Mark Swanson noted that he had likes to have the addition setback on the sides of the house and had adjust the house. He continued to present an overview of the adjustments to the addition to meet the rear yard setback. He also noted that the project was scaled back due to Covid-19 prices for materials.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that sometimes economy market forces help good architecture.

Mrs. Tennant asked if the existing house has three tab shingles.

Mr. Swanson responded that he will check. He stated that the new shingles on the addition will match the color of the existing house with architectural style shingles.

Commissioner Connelly asked if they are taking down any trees.

Mr. Swanson stated that he was not sure.

Commissioner Connolly motioned and Vice-Chairperson Coath seconded the motion to approve ARC 20-02 subject to the conditions provided by the ARC.

Roll call vote: Leslie Haynes-Eiring, absent; Tim Renaud, yes; Kevin Connolly, yes; Karen Plummer, yes; Vice-Chairperson Joe Coath, yes; Chairperson Marty O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 5-0. The motion to approve ARC 20-02 carried.

# # # # # #

ARC 21-02: Materials Review – Everlast Siding

The Petitioner is seeking approval of a new siding material for use in the Historic Overlay District.

Rick Fabris presented on behalf of the Masonic Lodge at 312 S Cook Street. He explained that 10 years ago that the siding on the building was renovated and since then the siding has started to decay. The Lodge is looking to reside the building and he believes the proposed Everlast Siding is a siding option the ARC should consider. He noted that the siding meets all the standards in the Design Guidelines, but does not meet the texture standard.

Mrs. Tennant stated that most of the Commissioners were able to see the sample. She also noted that she was able to look at the Everlast Siding on-site and provided photographs of the siding.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that he saw the photographs and asked if underneath the bottom edge of the siding you could see a stripe underneath at the overlap.

Mrs. Tennant responded that the siding piece completely covers the smooth connection piece. Ms. Tennant showed a picture of two pieces of the siding sample overlapping to demonstrate.

Mr. Fabris reiterated that they will be using the 4.5″ siding and does not want to do the 7″.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that there are three things that he is concerned about. The texture is rough sawn and our measure is smooth.

Mr. Fabris stated that at the last meeting that this material would be a great replacement for rough sawn. He continued that the contractor they has at the time of the last replacement said the siding underneath the aluminum siding was rough sawn. He continued that siding is as smooth as you can get for rough sawn cedar.

Chairperson O'Donnell stated that the material is kind of like rough sawn that has a really thin coat of high gloss enamel.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated another concern is that the siding material is not a painted finish. It is a plastic finish. I think that is a criteria of matching what is out there.

Mr. Fabris said last time we discussed this one of the things Marty was in favor of is that it was a composite material. He wouldn't call it a semi-gloss finish we should call it more of a satin finish, it definitely is not flat. It has to have some type of satin finish so the siding stays a clean as possible. Mr. Fabris continued that he knows this Committee does not like the Hardie material.

Chairperson O'Donnell clarified that the Hardie material looks like wood when it is painted. Even when it is not painted it has the appearance of wood.

Chairperson O'Donnell clarified Vice-Chairperson Coath's concern is that the material has the appearance of molded plastic.

Commissioner Plummer agreed.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that the siding system is dependent on a J-Channel for its installation which is common for a vinyl or aluminum siding. You cannot really butt stuff you have to create a receiving channel. It is not a butt joint.

Ms. Tennant showed a picture of the siding installed on a house and pointed out the J-Channel piece Vice-Chairperson Coath is referring to.

Commissioner Connolly stated that any protrusion will have to have a casing around it.

Mrs. Tennant stated that this is an important feature because this would prevent traditional trim details from happening.

Commissioner Connolly said that he thinks the siding would die into the J-channel.

Mr. Fabris stated that there are multiple ways to do the installation. They plan on using trim like the building has now. You can caulk this and there is almost no flex.

Vice-Chairperson Coath stated that this siding needs an overlapping joint feature for it to work and be installed.

Mr. Fabris asked Ms. Tennant to pull up the photo he provided of the historic church example. He said there is no J-Channel. When you look at the historic church building, this looks like the Lodge does now.

Mrs. Tennant stated that the Historic District has a set of guidelines that need to be followed. We don't know what the guidelines are for the church in the picture.

Vice-Chairperson Coath said we cannot assess the installation on the church.

Chairperson O'Donnell said he does not think that they are going to approve a J-Channel.

Mr. Fabris stated that the historic church photo shown has Everlast siding but are not using a J-Channel.

Commissioner Connolly noted that the information in the packet shows details with a J-Channel.

Mr. Fabris asked if there are any additional siding products that would be approved that he could take back to the Lodge.

Chairperson O'Donnell stated that it takes time and effort to research siding products.

Ms. Tennant responded that she ordered multiple product samples and has not found anything that would qualify. We have a sample of LP that we need to do further research on and will likely be considering at the April 8th meeting.

The Commission and Petitioner discussed the J-Channel issue further. Ms. Tennant showed pictures of trim pieces from the product specifications.

Mr. Fabris asked asked how the Lodge was a part of the Historic District in the first place. He also asked if the ARC could provide a siding product for the lodge to use. Mr. Fabris stated that their building was not originally part of the Historic District and somehow was added to the Historic District after the last remodel.

Chairperson O'Donnell asked if lodge building is in the Historic District.

Mrs. Tennant confirmed that the building is located in the Historic District said as far as she knows there have not been any modifications to the boundaries of the Historic District in the area around the Lodge. The Historic District was added to the National Register of Historic Places in the late 1980's and the Village enacted the boundaries of the Historic District in 2001. The Historic District has not always been in place. It is not related to the remodel.

Mr. Fabris said that somewhere in the Guidelines it says that if you cannot find appropriate product, you are able to go back to what you use to have. He asked if the lodge could back to the old aluminum siding that they used to have.

Ms. Tennant said that what the Lodge currently has is wood so they could maintain or replace with that material.

Mr. Fabris asked how he can present his case to the Village Board.

Mrs. Tennant stated that the ARC is final in the Historic District but that there is an appeal process that she can discuss with him.

Ms. Tennant explained the options for making a motion to approve and for making a motion to deny.

No public was present to comment.

Commissioner Plummer motioned to deny ARC 21-02 and Commissioner Connolly seconded the motion.

Roll call vote: Leslie Haynes-Eiring, absent; Tim Renaud, yes; Kevin Connolly, yes; Karen Plummer, yes; Vice-Chairperson Joe Coath, yes; Chairperson Marty O'Donnell, yes. The vote was 5-0. The motion to deny ARC 21-02 passed.

Chairperson O'Donnell stated that the Commission is interested in approving other products.

Mr. Fabris said he is interested in an LP and it has been around for many years and believes this product also goes underneath the trim.

Ms. Tennant said she is looking for local examples so the Commission can see it installed.

Mr. Fabris said they are looking to get the project done this spring. They might go with Hardie Artisan and knowing how it installs there needs to be a float space left. He is going to try and push the Lodge to go in that direction.

Vice-Chairperson Coath asked why they are replacing the siding.

Mr. Fabris said they were not allowed to insulate behind the siding and it got installed the wrong way and it is starting to rot from the underside.

# # # # # #

Approval of Minutes

October 8, 2020
October 8, 2020 minutes could not be approved due to lack of quorum.

# # # # # #

Adjournment
There being no additional business to come before the Commission, a motion was duly made by Plummer and seconded by Commissioner Connelly to adjourn the meeting at 7:25 p.m. Roll call vote.

Respectfully submitted,

Andrew Binder, Planning & Zoning Coordinator

Approved: April 8, 2021